

Master Drawings



VOLUME LVIII / NUMBER 3 / 2020

MASTER DRAWINGS ASSOCIATION, INC.

BOARD OF DIRECTORS	Clement C. Moore II, <i>President</i> George S. Abrams, <i>Vice President</i> Elizabeth M. Eveillard, <i>Vice President</i> Diane A. Nixon, <i>Vice President</i> Robert Loper, <i>Secretary</i>	George Frelinghuysen, <i>Treasurer</i> Colin B. Bailey Anne Searle Bent Mickey Cartin Alexander B. V. Johnson	David Lachenmann Janine Luke Lionel Sauvage Wheelock Whitney III Dian Woodner
EDITORIAL BOARD	Jane Turner, <i>Editor</i> Isabelle Dervaux, <i>Associate Editor</i> Margaret Morgan Grasselli, <i>Associate Editor</i>	John Marciari, <i>Associate Editor</i> Jennifer Tonkovich, <i>Associate Editor</i> Perrin Stein, <i>Reviews Editor</i>	Justine P. Hopkins, <i>Advancement and Marketing Manager</i> Aidel Kagan, <i>Administrator</i>
EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD	Clifford S. Ackley Maryan Ainsworth Hein-Th. Schulze Altcappenberg Jonathan Brown Emmanuelle Brugerolles Hugo Chapman Douglas W. Druick Albert J. Elen Chris Fischer Teréz Gerszi Lee Hendrix Alexey Larionov	Ger Luijten Suzanne Folds McCullagh Catherine Monbeig Goguel Patrick Noon Michiel Plomp Louis-Antoine Prat William W. Robinson Andrew Robison Pierre Rosenberg Martin Royaltan-Kisch Vadim A. Sadkov Klaus Albrecht Schröder	David Scrase Arlette Sérullaz Anna Maria Petrioli Tofani Nicholas Turner Carel van Tuyl van Serooskerken Françoise Viatte Hans Vlieghe Sir Christopher White Stephanie Wiles Andrew Wilton
BENEFACTORS	Anne Searle Bent Mickey Cartin Karen B. Cohen Arturo and Corinne Cuéllar Jean-Marie and Elizabeth M. Eveillard George Frelinghuysen Richard & Mary L. Gray Foundation	Alexander B. V. Johnson and Roberta J. M. Olson David Lachenmann Robert Loper Janine Luke Clement C. Moore II Diane A. Nixon	Wolfgang Ratjen Foundation Lawrence R. Ricciardi William Robinson Lionel Sauvage Wheelock Whitney III Dian Woodner One anonymous Benefactor
PATRONS	Allen Adler and Frances Beatty Russell Ely Burke III Christie's	Ch. F. Koenigs Richard Mansell-Jones Thomas Reid	Mrs. Oscar de la Renta Mark and Rochelle Rosenberg Pam Schafler
SPONSORS	Jean Bonna Livio Borghese Gilbert and Ildiko Butler James Faber Hubert and Mireille Goldschmidt Margaret Morgan Grasselli	Jeffrey Horvitz Foundation Benjamin Jarry Anne Varick Lauder John Marciari Christina van Marle Helen L. Porter and James T. Dyke	Hamilton Robinson, Jr. Elaine L. Rosenberg Scholz Charitable Lead Annuity Trust Sotheby's
INSTITUTIONAL PARTNERS	Clark Art Institute Denver Art Museum, Gates Family Foundation Fondation Custodia	Frick Collection Harvard Art Museums/ Fogg Museum Morgan Library & Museum	Museum of Fine Arts, Houston Princeton University Art Museum Yale Center for British Art

Articles

GIULIA DANIELE	
Prospero Fontana and the Impact in Bologna of Perino's <i>Christ Healing the Lame at the Pool of Bethesda</i>	291
MATHEW NORMAN	
Two New Drawings Related to Prints in the Carracci <i>Scuola perfetta</i>	307
ÁNGEL RODRÍGUEZ REBOLLO	
An Unpublished Design for a Retable by Alonso Cano in the Musée Magnin, Dijon	317
ANGELAMARIA ACETO	
A Drawing by Simone Cantarini, Called Il Pesarese, in the Ashmolean Museum, Oxford	327
MARTIN EIDELBERG	
Watteau's Drawings for the Plays of Thomas and Pierre Corneille	333
FRANÇOIS MARANDET	
Jean-Baptiste Vanloo: His Draftsmanship Elucidated	343
JON DAVIES	
Sell Your Parents: Marketing the Handwriting of Julia Warhola and Phung Vo	365

Reviews

FURIO RINALDI	
Rhoda Eitel-Porter and John Marciari, <i>Italian Renaissance Drawings at the Morgan Library & Museum</i>	383
DIETMAR SPENGLER	
Sonja Brink and Francesco Grisolia, eds., <i>Die Zeichnungen des Giovan Battista Beinaschi aus der Sammlung der Kunstakademie Düsseldorf im Kunstpalast</i>	395
ISABELLE MAYER-MICHALON	
Benjamin Couilleaux and Florence Hudowicz et al., <i>Génération en révolution: Dessins français du Musée Fabre, 1770–1815</i>	401

Letter

408

On the front cover

FRANÇOIS-
XAVIER FABRE

Study of an
Antique-style
Chair with
Drapery

*Montpellier, Musée
Fabre Montpellier
Méditerranée*

On the back cover

Here attributed to
JEAN-BAPTISTE
VANLOO

Study of Two
Nude Men, One
Partly Upright,
the Other Lying
Down

*Paris, École
Nationale Supérieure
des Beaux-Arts*

In the Next Issue

Northern draftsman, including
Dirk van der Lisse, Joos van
Winghe, and others

MASTER DRAWINGS is published quarterly by Master Drawings Association, Inc., 225 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016-3405. Annual subscription rates: DOMESTIC, one hundred and twenty-five dollars (\$125); FOREIGN, one hundred and sixty dollars (\$160). Periodical postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices. Return postage guaranteed to 225 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016-3405. Subscribers outside the United States may write to our editorial office for a list of bookdealers who handle foreign subscriptions.

For information concerning subscriptions and advertising, contact: Master Drawings Association, Inc., 225 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016-3405, tel: 212-590-0369; fax: 212-685-4740; administrator@masterdrawings.org or www.masterdrawings.org.

Master Drawings Association, or any body thereof, is not responsible for the content of advertisements or claims made by advertisers for goods offered for sale, including but not limited to artist attributions and provenance.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Master Drawings, c/o Master Drawings Association, Inc., 225 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016-3405. Copyright 2020 by Master Drawings Association, Inc., ISSN: 0025-5025.

Volume LVIII, no. 3
Published September 2020
Design by Jak Katalan
Layout by the Editor
Printed by Dolce Printing, Maywood, New Jersey

The mission of *Master Drawings* is to present the best and most important new research and reviews in the field of drawings, from the fourteenth century to our own time in Europe and the Americas. The journal is primarily concerned with the publication of newly discovered material, significant new reattributions, and fresh interpretations.



Prospero Fontana and the Impact in Bologna of Perino's *Christ Healing the Lame at the Pool of Bethesda*

GIULIA DANIELE

In 2011, in an article devoted to the Bolognese painter Leonello Spada (1576–1622), Angelo Mazza published a painting of *Christ Healing the Lame at the Pool of Bethesda*,¹ then known only through an old black-and-white photograph (Fig. 1).² The painting was ascribed to Pellegrino Tibaldi (1527–1596), but Mazza reattributed it to Tibaldi's elder colleague Prospero Fontana (1509–1597), pointing out that it presented a mixture of “Vasarian models in the group on the lower right and inventive suggestions worthy of Perino del Vaga in the elegant *contrapposto* seen in the figure of Christ, while the figures to the left, and more generally the solemn composition, recall the Michelangesque components of Pellegrino Tibaldi's figurative language.”³ Although Mazza's analysis is accurate and precise, the scholar did not recognize the exact iconographic source from which the painting was derived—namely the now destroyed fresco of the same subject painted by Piero Bonaccorsi, called Perino del Vaga (1501–1547), formerly on one of the side walls of the Massimo Chapel in SS. Trinità dei Monti, Rome.

The history of the chapel's decorations is well documented. Originally dedicated to the Magdalene and decorated by Giulio Romano (1499[?]-1546) and his workshop,⁴ it was purchased in 1537 by Angelo Massimo (1491–1550) and completed the following year by Perino with the help of Daniele da Volterra (1509–1566) and Guglielmo della Porta (1515–1577). Giorgio Vasari (1511–1574), in his enthusiastic descrip-



Figure 1

PROSPERO FONTANA
(after PERINO DEL
VAGA)

Old photograph by
Studio Clari, Milan, of
Figure 2

Bologna, Soprintendenza
Archeologia, Belle Arti e
Paesaggio per le Province di
Bologna, Modena, Reggio
Emilia e Ferrara



Figure 2

PROSPERO
FONTANA (after
PERINO DEL
VAGA)

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda

Private Collection

tion, recalled how Perino:

made a design of bizarre and beautiful grotesques, ... and he executed two little scenes of great size, surrounding them with a stucco ornament of great variety. One scene was the "Pool of Bethesda," with the cripples and sick people, and the angel who comes to move the waters, the porticoes seen most beautifully foreshortened in perspec-

tive, and the movements and vestments of the priests, all painted with great grace and vivacity, although the figures are not very large. In the other, he painted the "Raising of Lazarus".... There are so many great scenes; in that of the "Centurion [of Capernaum] Beseeking Christ to Heal His Dying Son," in another "Christ Driving the Moneychangers from the Temple," in a third "The Transfiguration," and in the last a similar scene.⁵

Figure 3

PERINO DEL
VAGA

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda (recto
of Fig. 4)

New York, Morgan
Library & Museum



Although the sixteenth-century fresco decorations are now mostly destroyed,⁶ their layout has been reconstructed through documentary sources and various drawn studies, first catalogued and published by J. A. Gere.⁷ The perceived success of Perino's composition is further documented by his reuse of the scenes for the famous circular rock-crystal plaques he designed for the sumptuous gilt silver candlesticks made for the Farnese Chapel in St. Peter's, Rome. These were engraved by the medalist and gemcutter Giovanni Bernardi da Castel Bolognese (1494–1553) and are today preserved in the Museo del Tesoro of the Vatican Basilica.⁸

When he published the old photograph of the painting, Mazza transcribed the notes written on its back, which, in addition to specifying the support, technique, and measurements of the work, also recorded the fact that the photograph had been shot by the Milanese Studio Clari when

the painting was in the family collection of the Ferrarese painter Filippo de Pisis (1896–1956). By pursuing this lead, I was able to contact the painter's heirs, from whom I received the color image published here (Fig. 2). The canvas had remained with the family until 1987, when it was stolen, but following its rediscovery in 2019, it has now been returned to its legitimate owners.⁹

The De Pisis painting is an important record of Perino's invention. Two compositional studies by Bonaccorsi related to the *Pool of Bethesda* and several copies after it are known, and in the absence of the original fresco, these constituted until now the only significant visual source for reconstructing the composition. The first of these preparatory drawings is a double-sided sheet by Perino for the abovementioned Farnese Chapel rock-crystal plaques, preserved in the Morgan Library & Museum, New York (Fig. 3).¹⁰ This represents on

the recto an iconographic adaptation with a round format, drawn in reverse with respect to the rectangular scene designed for the chapel wall, while the verso (Fig. 4) has a pen tracing of the main figure group with Christ from the recto composition. This may have been done not by Perino himself but by one of the artists who later depicted this group and who thus evidently had access to the master's original study.¹¹ A second preparatory drawing for the fresco is in the British Museum, London (Fig. 5),¹² and features studies of the central figures on the right side of the scene, as well as a figure represented from behind who is absent from the roundel designs but found in other records of the fresco, including a chiaroscuro woodcut (Fig. 6).¹³ Adam von Bartsch attributed this woodcut to an anonymous printmaker after Parmigianino (1503–1540),¹⁴ but it is now generally considered to record Perino's lost fresco and is usually attributed to Niccolò Vicentino (*fl.* c. 1540–50).¹⁵ In reality, the actual prototype from which the print derives was most likely a double-sided drawing in the Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi, Florence (Figs. 7–8),¹⁶ currently classified as by Pellegrino Tibaldi and known to Gere, who did not, however, link it directly to the chiaroscuro woodcut. On the



Figure 4

PERINO DEL
VAGA

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda (verso
of Fig. 3)

New York, Morgan
Library & Museum

Figure 5

PERINO DEL
VAGA

Figure Studies for
Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool of
Bethesda

London, British
Museum





verso, the sheet has anatomical sketches and a grotesque mask (Fig. 7), while the squared recto (Fig. 8) reproduces in its entirety the *Pool of Bethesda* that Perino had painted on a wall in the Massimo Chapel. During a close examination of this drawing, I noticed the presence on some of the figures of very small letters and annotations, possibly referring to the colors used in the prototype and highlighting the artist's intent to create an accurate painted copy, an hypothesis strengthened by the subsequent squaring of the recto. It is conceivable, in fact, that the resulting painted copy could well have been the De Pisis canvas. For example, in the drawing under Christ's sleeve (Fig. 9), one sees the annotation "rosa" (pink), which corresponds precisely to the color used in the painting, and on the left sleeve of the kneeling, paralysed figure's tunic is the letter "g," indicating "giallo" (yellow).

A second, rather damaged sheet, now in the Prado, Madrid, where it is catalogued generically as by an "anonymous [artist] after Perino del Vaga" (Fig. 10),¹⁷ not only has a composition identical to that of the Uffizi and the same color annotations,



Figure 6 (above left)

Attributed to
NICCOLÒ
VICENTINO (after
PERINO DEL
VAGA)

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda

Chiaroscuro
woodcut

London, British
Museum

Figure 7

PROSPERO
FONTANA

Grotesque Mask
and Sketches of a
Male Nude
(verso of Fig. 8)

Florence, Gabinetto
Disegni e Stampe
degli Uffizi



Figure 8
 PROSPERO
 FONTANA
 (after PERINO
 DEL VAGA)
 Christ Healing the
 Lame at the Pool
 of Bethesda
 (recto of Fig. 8)
 Florence, Gabinetto
 Disegni e Stampe
 degli Uffizi

Figure 9
 PROSPERO
 FONTANA
 (after PERINO
 DEL VAGA)
 Detail of color
 notes inscribed
 on Figure 8
 Florence, Gabinetto
 Disegni e Stampe
 degli Uffizi

Figure 10

Here attributed
to PROSPERO
FONTANA
(after PERINO
DEL VAGA)

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda

Madrid, Museo
Nacional del Prado



but seems also to be drawn by the same hand and to the same scale as the Uffizi sheet. The stylus indentation and the losses on the surface of the drawing are evidence of its transfer to or from another support or to a new medium—or maybe even both. The Prado sheet could have been the model from which the wooden matrix for the woodcut was cut, even if there are minor differences between the two compositions. For example, in the wood-

cut the window in the right background is not a serliana, as in the Uffizi and Prado drawings, but a single central round opening above a triangular tympanum, and the flying angel's foot overlaps the central column. This suggests a degree of autonomous re-elaboration enjoyed by the printmaker. Notwithstanding these minor variations, the link between the two drawings and the canvas is underscored by the identical cropping of the composition



Figure 11
PELEGRINO
TIBALDI
Christ Disputing
with the Doctors
Bologna, Pinacoteca
Nazionale

at the same unusual points, such as the extended foot of the kneeling paralytic and one of the wings of the hovering angel.

After careful analysis, and in light of my work on Prospero Fontana¹⁸—who started his early career in Genoa as one of Perino’s young assistants at the Palazzo Doria—I thoroughly endorse Mazza’s proposal for changing the attribution of the De Pisis painting from Tibaldi to Fontana, since its figures and coloristic fusion corresponds perfectly with Prospero’s style. Of course, Tibaldi—who had himself grown up in the shadow of Perino and had been active at the Della Rovere Chapel (1548–50) in the same church of SS. Trinità dei Monti¹⁹—also knew Perino’s fresco of *Christ at the Pool of Bethesda*. This he quoted, for instance, with the figures in his *Christ Disputing with the Doctors* (probably c. 1553), a fresco painted for S. Michele in Bosco, Bologna, and now in the city’s Pinacoteca Nazionale (Fig. 11),²⁰ but it is not easy to reconcile the graceful, subtle, and sinuous shapes present in the De Pisis painting with Tibaldi’s more rigid and structured volumes reminiscent of Michelangelo (1475–1564).

Mazza’s dating of the painting to the 1560s is

also probably correct, both for the use of the canvas support, which would be unlikely at an earlier moment in Fontana’s career, and in the typological comparison between the face of Christ and that of the same figure depicted by Prospero in his painting of *The Resurrection* of c. 1560, previously on offer by the gallery Fondantico, Bologna, and now in a private collection (Fig. 12).²¹ Moreover, I am inclined to agree with Eraldo Gaudio (who did not know the De Pisis painting) in connecting the Uffizi drawing to Prospero.²² In 1576, for Fontana’s *St. Alexius of Rome Distributing Alms* for the altar of the Orsi Chapel in S. Giacomo Maggiore, Bologna (Fig. 13),²³ he directly reused the group of figures in the background of the Uffizi sheet (Fig. 14); he also seems to have based the crouching beggar in the right foreground on the pose of the analogous male figure in the De Pisis exemplar. Fontana’s apprenticeship with Perino remained a crucial factor for his personal development, and he adopted models by his master several times in his own work.²⁴

Despite the fact that Fontana’s drawn oeuvre remains to be thoroughly studied and coherently reconstructed,²⁵ the Florence sheet finds good



Figure 12
PROSPERO
FONTANA
The Resurrection
Private Collection



Figure 13 (left)
PROSPERO
FONTANA
St. Alexius of
Rome Distributing
Alms, 1576

Bologna, S. Giacomo
Maggiore, Orsi
Chapel

Figure 14 (right)
PROSPERO
FONTANA
(after PERINO
DEL VAGA)
Detail of Figure 8

Florence, Gabinetto
Disegni e Stampe
degli Uffizi

comparisons, both technically and stylistically, with securely autograph sketches by the artist. These include, for instance, examples with similar dense patterns of squaring, such as a pair in the British Museum, London (e.g., Fig. 15),²⁶ and another sheet in the Uffizi, also after Perino del Vaga (Fig. 16).²⁷

We can thus hypothesize that Prospero drew the Uffizi sheet of *Christ Healing the Lame at the Pool of Bethesda* during his stay in Rome in the service of Pope Julius III del Monte (1550–1555),²⁸ either directly from the fresco or by copying a lost original drawing by Perino, to which he then added color notes on the spot in the chapel.²⁹ Later, he would have made the Prado sheet in a more schematized form, traced on thinner paper, and likely then given to the printmaker, who indented it in order to create the woodcut. Perhaps at some subsequent moment and for unknown reasons—maybe at the request



Figure 15
PROSPERO
FONTANA
Display of
Tableware with
Servants and an
Infant Satyr

London, British
Museum



Figure 16

PROSPERO FONTANA (after PERINO DEL VAGA)

Dispute between the Muses and the Pierides (Daughters of King Pierus)

Florence, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi

of the patron—the Uffizi *Pool of Bethesda* drawing was squared and used to make the copy on canvas. In the painting, the head of Christ is more upright compared to its position in the drawings and woodcut. It is perhaps no coincidence that this passage of the Uffizi drawing was not squared, thus allowing for some reinterpretation and artistic license in the painted copy,³⁰ which adheres more closely in the arrangement of this group of figures to Perino’s round sketch at the Morgan Library.

FURTHER IMPACT IN BOLOGNA OF PERINO’S POOL OF BETHESDA COMPOSITION

It is necessary at this point to consider further Prospero Fontana’s activity as a draftsman. In fact, the British Museum also preserves under his name a series of sheets used by the Bolognese engraver Giulio Bonasone (fl. c. 1531–74) as models for some of the printed illustrations in an emblem book entitled *Symbolicarum quaestionum*, first edited in 1555 in Bologna by the humanist professor of Greek, Achille Bocchi (1488–1562), one of Prospero’s greatest friends.³¹ Thus, collaborating with printmakers was nothing new to Fontana. Moreover, his wife, Antonia de’ Bonardis, was the daughter of a famous Bolognese *cartarius* (book printer), Pellegrino de’ Bonardis (fl. 1550–84).³² Bologna was one of the Italian hubs for the development of

the chiaroscuro woodcut: it was where the workshop of Niccolò Vicentino was located,³³ so it is not a stretch to imagine that Prospero would have known him personally and could occasionally have provided him—and other local printmakers³⁴—with designs such as the Prado drawing.

Further proof of the critical fortunes in Bologna of Perino’s composition of *Christ Healing the Lame at the Pool of Bethesda* is to be found by looking at the German collector Paulus Praun (1548–1616), a native of Nuremberg and a member of an old family of silk brocade merchants and manufacturers, who settled in Bologna during the sixteenth century. Praun maintained strong links with the Italian city and with its most prominent local artists, eventually creating a rich and important collection of works on paper. At his death, his brother arranged for the nucleus of Italian acquisitions to be reunited with the art assembled in Nuremberg to create the so-called Praunische Kabinett (kept with the family until 1801).³⁵ A portrait of him by Prospero’s celebrated daughter, Lavinia Fontana (1552–1614), is preserved in the Germanisches Nationalmuseum, Nuremberg (Fig. 17).³⁶ She may have come into contact with the merchant and



Figure 17

LAVINIA FONTANA

Portrait of Paulus Praun

Nuremberg, Germanisches Nationalmuseum

collector through her influential father or possibly through her husband, Giovanni Paolo Zappi (b. c. 1548), who, according to sources, supported his wife's work by preparing the sumptuous clothes worn by her sitters.³⁷ Who better to turn to in this regard than the local silk brocade merchant?³⁸



Figure 18

MARIA
KATHARINA
PRESTEL (after
ANONYMOUS
ARTIST)

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda

Etching and
aquatint

Braunschweig,
Herzog Anton
Ulrich-Museum



Figure 19

ANONYMOUS
ARTIST (after
PERINO DEL
VAGA)

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda

Budapest, Museum
of Fine Arts

The 1797 catalogue of the Praunische Kabinett, compiled by C. T. de Murr in preparation for the 1801 auction of the whole collection organized by Praun's heirs, lists a "guerison du malade auprès du laves de Bethesda. Dessin fait à la plume, et lavé en bistre," then attributed to Giorgio Vasari (1511–1574).³⁹ In 1777 the same sheet was recorded in an etching (Fig. 18) by Maria Katharina Prestel (1747–1794),⁴⁰ and it is clear from the shadows and details such as the pavement and pool beneath Christ's feet that the source was a drawing now in the Museum of Fine Arts, Budapest (Fig. 19), where it is catalogued as "anonymous after Perino del Vaga."⁴¹ This, in fact, came from the collection of Prince Nikolaus II Esterházy (1765–1833), which contained several drawings bought from Praun's cabinet, and which was later acquired in

Figure 20

ANONYMOUS
ARTIST (after
PERINO DEL
VAGA)

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda

Paris, Musée du
Louvre, Département
des Arts Graphiques



1870 by the state of Hungary.⁴² This, in turn, is related to a more refined drawing in the Louvre, Paris (Fig. 20),⁴³ which is currently attributed to an “anonymous Florentine artist.” This was acquired for the Cabinet du Roi in 1671 from the collection of Everhard Jabach (1618–1695).

Finally, to round out the circle, there is an interesting anonymous drawing in the Akademie der Bildenden Künste, Vienna (Fig. 21),⁴⁴ which was mentioned in a footnote by Gaudioso but has never been reproduced. Like the Uffizi and Prado sheets, the Vienna and Budapest drawings are of similar dimensions and appear to be directly connected, though in reverse to each other. Interestingly, the pose of Christ in the Austrian example (especially the tilt of his head) corresponds to the figures of him in the drawings by Prospero Fontana in the Uffizi and Prado and in Vicentino’s chiaroscuro woodcut.

In this somewhat complex set of iterations of Perino’s composition, it is not easy to identify an author for each sheet or to define the exact role every piece played in relation to the others. What we know—or at least may suppose with

some degree of certainty—is that the Budapest drawing, like the works here directly associated with Prospero Fontana (i.e., the Uffizi and Prado drawings, the De Pisis canvas, and the Vicentino reproductive woodcut), was also once in Bologna, where Paulus Praun probably acquired it for his collection. In contrast to the Prospero-related compositions, which match one another in practically every detail, the drawings in Budapest, Paris, and Vienna reveal a degree of independence. The figures are more elaborated, as can be seen in the flying angel who holds a palm branch in his hand, a detail that was barely distinguishable in the other sheets and in the painting itself. The reworking of the model in these three sheets—or perhaps their more precise adherence to Perino’s lost fresco—is also proved by the detail of the angel’s left foot overlapping a portion of the column (as already noticed in the autonomous parts of the woodcut), and by the fact that in all of them the plinth of the same column, otherwise visible, is totally covered by Christ’s head. Indeed, both the Hungarian and the Austrian sheets would appear to derive from the more “archaic” and rigid Louvre version by another anonymous artist. The Budapest iteration exactly retraces the Louvre composition, while the second, more refined version in Vienna modifies only the position of Christ’s head, presenting at the same time some rapidly sketched marks underneath the ink.

In the absence of further evidence, it is impossible at this juncture to establish the exact nature of the link between the two groups of drawings or to determine their authors. For the time being, our incomplete knowledge of Prospero Fontana’s draftsmanship precludes an attribution to him of either the Vienna or Budapest drawings. Yet their style and handling, with some resemblance to the work of Vasari, particularly in the shapes of the small figures in the background, suggest a Bolognese origin and a context close to Fontana himself. The faces in the figures on the left of the Vienna drawing seem closer to those in the Uffizi example and to elements found in Prospero’s designs in the British Museum for the *Symbolicarum quaestionum* (e.g., Fig. 22).⁴⁵ Even if

we cannot establish the exact authorship or purpose of these copies, we can certainly situate them within the circle of Prospero Fontana.

There can be little doubt of the influence exercised in Bologna by Perino's notable Roman model, probably as a direct result of the copies of Prospero Fontana, whose crucial role in sixteenth-century Italian art is still to be fully appreciated and understood. His relationship with Perino represented a decisive moment in his professional development and most likely lay behind the reverence and respect that he enjoyed in his native Bologna. The rediscovered De Pisis canvas provides new and valuable testimony to the esteem in which he held his former master in his early years and heralds the wider series of quotations discussed above. The model of Perino was without doubt the common denominator on which Fontana—as a kind of lynchpin—structured his relationship with both Daniele da Volterra (a topic that undoubtedly deserves greater study) and the younger Pellegrino Tibaldi, a colleague and companion of both and the last heir of Raphael's greatest epigone.⁴⁶



Figure 21

ANONYMOUS
ARTIST (after
PERINO DEL
VAGA)

Christ Healing the
Lame at the Pool
of Bethesda

Vienna, Akademie
der Bildenden Künste

Giulia Daniele obtained her PhD in 2018 at the Università "La Sapienza," Rome, with a monographic dissertation on Prospero Fontana, of whose painted work she completed the first catalogue raisonné. In 2019 she was post-doctoral fellow at the Fondazione 1563 per l'Arte e la Cultura della Compagnia di S. Paolo, Turin.

NOTES

1. The miraculous episode in which Christ heals the paralyzed man by the Pool of Bethesda in Jerusalem is found in the Gospel of John (5: 1–17).
2. Oil on canvas; 108 x 75.5 cm; see Angelo Mazza, "Leonello Spada e la 'memoria' di Venceslao Lazzari all'Archiginnasio," *L'Archiginnasio*, 103, 2008 (2011), pp. 289–340. The photograph can be found among the material assembled by Francesco Malaguzzi Valeri, now preserved in the photographic archive of the Soprintendenza Archeologia, Belle Arti e Paesaggio per le Province di Bologna, Modena, Reggio Emilia e Ferrara (inv. no. 36.691.3).
3. See *ibid.*, pp. 312–13; Eng. trans. from the Italian by the author.
4. On the chapel's decoration, see Christopher L.C.E. Witcombe, "The Chapel of the Courtesan and the Quarrel of the Magdalens," *Art Bulletin*, 84, no. 2, 2002, pp. 273–92;

Figure 22

PROSPERO
FONTANA

Design for
Emblem CXVIII of
Achille Bocchi's
*Symbolicarum
quaestionum*
(Bologna, 1555)

London, British
Museum

- Antonio Vannugli, “Un'altra 'Lettera rubata': La decorazione della cappella di S. Maria Maddalena nella SS. Trinità dei Monti e il vero *Noli me tangere* di Giulio Romano e Giovan Francesco Penni,” *Storia dell'Arte*, 111, 2005, pp. 59–96; and Linda Wolk-Simon, “The Lost Decoration of the Chapel of the Magdalene by Giulio Romano and Giovanni Francesco Penni in SS. Trinità dei Monti in Rome: Some New Drawings,” *Master Drawings*, 49, no. 2, 2011, pp. 147–58.
5. See Giorgio Vasari, *Le Vite de' più eccellenti pittori, scultori, ed architettori*, Florence, 1568; Eng. trans. by Gaston du C. de Vere, 10 vols., London, 1912–15, vol. 6 (1913), pp. 216–17 (available online at http://www.gutenberg.org/files/28422/28422-h/28422-h.htm#Page_187). See also Elena Parma Armani, *Perin del Vaga, l'anello mancante: Studi sul Manierismo*, Genoa, 1986, pp. 183–87.
 6. Following the collapse of the chapel's vault in the nineteenth century, the fresco of the *Raising of Lazarus* was detached; it is today the only one preserved, albeit in a compromised state, now in the Victoria & Albert Museum, London (inv. no. 362.1876; fresco transferred to canvas; 163.6 x 114.9 cm); see J. A. Gere, “Two Late Fresco Cycles by Perino del Vaga: The Massimi Chapel and the Sala Paolina,” *Burlington Magazine*, 102, no. 682, 1960, fig. 8; and <http://collections.vam.ac.uk/item/O119624>.
 7. See Gere 1960, pp. 9–19; Konrad Oberhuber, “Observations on Perino del Vaga as a Draughtsman,” *Master Drawings*, 4, no. 2, 1966, pp. 170–82; and Elena Parma, *Perino del Vaga tra Raffaello e Michelangelo*, exh. cat., Mantua, Galleria Civica di Palazzo Te, 2001, pp. 178–83. Among Perino's extant drawings for the chapel decoration is one in the Victoria & Albert Museum, London (inv. no. 2270; pen and brown ink, with brown wash; 397 x 257 mm; see Gere 1960, fig. 16; and <http://collections.vam.ac.uk/item/O128551>), and one in the Museum of Fine Arts, Budapest (inv. no. 1838; pen and brown ink, with brown wash, over black chalk; 419 x 290 mm; see Gere 1960, fig. 17; and <https://www.mfab.hu/artworks/recto-study-for-a-wall-of-the-massimi-chapel-in-ss-trinita-dei-monti>).
 8. See Ernst Kris, “Di alcune opere ignote di Giovanni dei Bernardi nel Tesoro di San Pietro,” *Dedalo*, 9, 1928–29, pp. 97–111; Gere 1960, p. 13; and Parma Armani 1986, pp. 183–87.
 9. I wish to express my profound gratitude to Dr. Maddalena Tibertelli de Pisis, curator of the archive of the Associazione per Filippo de Pisis, Milan, for her interest and generous support of this research.
 10. Inv. no. IV, 47. Recto: pen and brown ink, over red chalk; diam.: 204 mm; see Rhoda Eitel-Porter and John Marciari, *Italian Renaissance Drawings at the Morgan Library & Museum*, New York, 2019, no. 44, repr. (in color); and www.themorgan.org/drawings/item/142297.
 11. As I will argue below, I believe this could have been Prospero Fontana.
 12. Inv. no. 1946,0713.568. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash; 128 x 172 mm; see Philip Pouncey and J. A. Gere, *Italian Drawings in the British Museum: Raphael and His Circle*, 2 vols., London, 1962, vol. 1, no. 169, repr.; and www.britishmuseum.org/collection/object/P_1946-0713-568. On the verso is a sketch of Neptune driving three seahorses.
 13. London, British Museum, inv. no. 1941,1213.535 (chiaroscuro woodcut; 267 x 202 mm); see Adam von Bartsch, *Le Peintre graveur*, 21 vols., Vienna, 1803–21 [hereafter B.], vol. 12, p. 38, no. 14; and www.britishmuseum.org/collection/object/P_1941-1213-535. Drawn copies after the woodcut can be found in the Louvre, Paris (inv. no. 5646); the Hessisches Landesmuseum, Darmstadt (inv. no. AE 1848); and the Teylers Museum, Haarlem (inv. no. B009).
 14. See B.XII, 38.14.
 15. See Naoko Takahatake, ed., *The Chiaroscuro Woodcut in Renaissance Italy*, exh. cat., Los Angeles, Los Angeles County Museum of Art, and Washington, DC, National Gallery of Art, 2018, no. 58 (text by Linda Stiber Morenus, with previous bibliog.), repr. (in color). The derivation from Perino's fresco had already been noticed in the eighteenth century by Pierre-Jean Mariette (1694–1774), *Abecedario* (MS., Paris, Bib. N., Cab. Est.); ed. by Ph. de Chennevières and A. de Montaignon as “Abecedario de P. J. Mariette et autres notes inédites de cet amateur sur les arts et les artistes,” *Archives de l'Art Français*, 6 vols., 1851–62; reprint, Paris, 1966, vol. 1 (1851–53), pp. 205–6 and 309.
 16. Inv. no. 1460 F. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash, on paper; 218 x 157 mm; see Gere 1960, p. 13 (with incorrect inv. no.).
 17. Inv. no. D001785. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash, the outlines indented with a stylus; 220 x 168 mm; see Nicholas Turner, *Museo del Prado: Dibujos italianos del siglo XVI*, exh. cat., Madrid, Museo del Prado, 2004, p. 352, repr. (in color); idem, *From Michelangelo to Annibale Carracci: A Century of Italian Drawings from the Prado*, exh. cat., Art Services International, 2008–9, p. 352, repr. (in color); and www.museodelprado.es/coleccion/obra-de-arte/el-estancue-de-bethesda/6128d5ee-d980-4be3-afa3-cb4d0dd28730.
 18. See Giulia Daniele, “Prospero Fontana 'Pictor Bononiensis' (1509–1597): Catalogo ragionato dei dipinti,” PhD diss., Rome, Università “La Sapienza,” 2016–17; eadem, “Prospero Fontana tra Genova e Bologna (1528–1539): Proposte e documenti per la sua prima attività,” *Ricche Minere*, 9, 2018, pp. 23–35 [hereafter Daniele 2018a]; eadem, “Sul viaggio di Prospero Fontana in Francia: Un primo documento e qualche riflessione,” in Claudia Di Bello et al., eds., *In corso d'opera, 2: Ricerche dei dottorandi in storia dell'arte della Sapienza*, Rome, 2018, pp. 107–14 [hereafter Daniele 2018b]; eadem, “Prospero Fontana pittore, scenografo e plastificatore,” in Serena Quagliaroli and Giulia Spoltore, eds., “Quegli ornamenti più ricchi e più begli che si potesse fare nella difficoltà di quell'

- arte”: La decorazione a stucco a Roma tra Cinquecento e Seicento: modelli, influenze, fortuna,” *Horti Hesperidum*, 1, 2019, pp. 161–72 and 311–18, pls. 91–101; eadem, “Pellegrino Tibaldi e Prospero Fontana ad Ancona: Circuiti di committenza tra Bologna e la Marca,” in Valentina Balzarotti and Anna Maria Ambrosini Massari, eds., “*Di somma aspettazione e di bellissimo ingegno*”: Pellegrino Tibaldi e le Marche: Proceedings of the International Conference Held at Palazzo Ferretti–Museo Archeologico Nazionale delle Marche, Ancona, 11–12 April 2019 (forthcoming); and eadem, “Prospero Fontana, pittore di Giulio III del Monte: Addenda agli anni romani (1550–1555),” *Rivista dell’Istituto Nazionale d’Archeologia e Storia dell’Arte*, 76, 2021 (forthcoming).
19. Daniele da Volterra worked in the chapel in 1548. For Tibaldi’s activity in Rome during this period, see Vittoria Romani, *Tibaldi “d’intorno” a Perino*, Padua, 1990, p. 42.
 20. Inv. no. 1352 (detached fresco; 71 x 106.5 cm); see Guido Zucchini, “San Michele in Bosco di Bologna,” *L’Archiginnasio*, 38, 1943, pp. 18–70 (esp. p. 51); Giuliano Briganti, *Il Manierismo e Pellegrino Tibaldi*, Rome 1945, p. 119; Christine Baltay, “Pellegrino Tibaldi in Bologna and the Marches,” PhD diss., New York University, 1984, p. 205; and www.pinacotecabologna.beniculturali.it/it/content_page/item/362-gesu-cristo-risponde-alle-domande-dei-farisei.
 21. Oil on canvas; 170 x 140 cm; see Giovanni Sassu, “Sull’affidabilità dell’osservatore dal vivo,” in Marinella Pigozzi, ed., *Bologna al tempo di Cavazzoni: Approfondimenti*, Bologna, 1999, pp. 45–110 (esp. pp. 102–10); Marzia Faietti and Dominique Cordellier, eds., *Il Cinquecento a Bologna: Disegni dal Louvre e dipinti a confronto*, exh. cat., Bologna, Pinacoteca Nazionale, 2002, no. 61 (text by Giovanni Sassu), repr.; Daniele Benati, ed., *Il prestigio dell’arte: Dipinti dal XVI al XIX secolo*, exh. cat., Bologna, Fondantico Arte e Antiquariato, 2009, no. 4 (text by Vera Fortunati), repr. (in color); and Daniele 2018b, pp. 107–14 (esp. p. 108, pl. 48).
 22. See Filippa Maria Aliberti Gaudio and Eraldo Gaudio, eds., *Gli affreschi di Paolo III a Castel Sant’Angelo: Progetto ed esecuzione (1543–1548)*, exh. cat., 2 vols., Rome, Museo Nazionale di Castel Sant’Angelo, 1981–82, vol. 2, p. 160, under no. 111 (text by Eraldo Gaudio).
 23. Oil on canvas; 340 x 225 cm; see Vera Fortunati Pietrantonio, ed., *Pitturabolognese del ‘500*, 2 vols., Bologna, 1986, vol. 1, p. 404, repr.; and www.catalogo.beniculturali.it/sigecSSU_FE/dettaglioScheda.action?{Emilia%20Romagna}&{Emilia%20Romagna}=statoDove1=08&{keycode}=ICCD2421668&valoreRicerca=&titoloScheda=pala%20d%27altare&stringBeneCategoria=&selezioneSchede=&contenitore=&flagFisico-Giuridico=0. The dating for the painting here adopted (1576) is based on new, unpublished documents found by me (see Daniele 2016–17, no. D42).
 24. See Daniele 2018a. In my opinion, for instance, a previously anonymous, unpublished *Lamentation* in the Museo Nazionale di Villa Guinigi, Lucca (inv. no. 239; oil on panel; 120 x 101 cm), can be attributed to Prospero Fontana. It replicates Perino’s version of the subject in the State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg (inv. no. ГЭ-8468; oil on panel; 197 x 145 cm; see www.hermitagemuseum.org/wps/portal/hermitage/digital-collection/01.+paintings/30370), and compares perfectly with Fontana’s signed and dated *Deposition* (1563) in the Art Gallery of New South Wales, Sydney (inv. no. 219.1994; oil on panel, 193 x 116.5 cm; see www.artgallery.nsw.gov.au/collection/works/219.1994).
 25. It is my intention to do so very soon. Until then, see Bernice Davidson, “*Perino del Vaga e la sua cerchia*: Addenda and Corrigenda,” *Master Drawings*, 7, no. 4, 1969, pp. 404–9; J. A. Gere, “The Decoration of the Villa Giulia,” *Burlington Magazine*, 107, no. 745, 1965, pp. 198–206; Marzia Faietti, “Disegni giovanili di Prospero Fontana: Da Perino a Vasari, attraverso Salviati,” in Catherine Monbeig-Goguel et al., eds., *Francesco Salviati et la Bella Maniera: Proceedings of the International Conference Held in Rome and Paris, 1998*, Rome, 2001, pp. 547–75; Florian Härb, “Prospero Fontana, Alias Giorgio Vasari: Collaboration and the Limits of Authorship,” in *ibid.*, pp. 577–608; and Giovanni Sassu, “Giorgio Aretin invenit: Osservazioni su Vasari ‘designer’ per Prospero Fontana,” *Artibus et Historiae*, 64, 2011, pp. 129–51.
 26. Inv. no. 2008,7023.1. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash and opaque white, over black chalk, on blue paper; squared for transfer; 309 x 216 mm; see www.britishmuseum.org/collection/object/P_2008-7023-1. The sheet was identified by Hugo Chapman as the missing left-hand section of inv. no. 1875,0710.2631 (354 x 542 mm); see Gere and Pouncey 1983, no. 103, repr.; and https://www.britishmuseum.org/collection/object/P_1875-0710-2631.
 27. Inv. no. 12602 F. Pen and brown ink, with gray-brown wash; squared in brown ink; 152 x 203 mm; see Fortunati Pietrantonio (ed.) 1986, vol. 1, p. 376, repr. The sheet is a preparatory study for one of Fontana’s paintings in Palazzo Firenze in Rome (c. 1554–55), for which see *ibid.*, p. 376, repr. That Perino was the source is implied by another drawing by Prospero in the Uffizi (inv. no. 907 S), which on the recto has studies of some Genoese inventions by Perino, including the same female group on the left of the composition (see Daniele 2018a, with previous bibliog.). A similar model for these figures is found on the drawing of the *Triumph of Bacchus in India* in the Albertina, Vienna (inv. no. 444; see [https://sammlungenonline.albertina.at/?query=search=/record/objectnumbersearch=\[444\]](https://sammlungenonline.albertina.at/?query=search=/record/objectnumbersearch=[444])), whose attribution oscillates between Raphael and Perino; in any case, the latter reused it for his fresco of the subject in the Palazzo Doria, Genoa.
 28. Fontana’s residence in Rome during the 1540s and his alleged work alongside Perino at the Farnese construction site of Castel Sant’Angelo, traditionally accepted by scholars, is controversial. Although it remains a viable possibility, it needs to be reviewed in light of new documents found and discussed by me (see Daniele 2016–17, pp. 30–36).

29. It is also possible that he annotated the drawing only with his personal color choices in order to remember them when making the final painting. If that were the case, a potential analogous example is the preparatory drawing with color annotations in the Hessischen Landesmuseum, Darmstadt (inv. no. AE 1727; pen and gray-brown ink, with gray-brown wash; 258 x 193 mm; see <https://www.bildindex.de/document/obj08033987>), which is for his signed *Holy Family with Saints* in the National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne (inv. no. 839-5; oil on panel; 102.2 x 82.8 cm; see www.ngv.vic.gov.au/explore/collection/work/3959).
30. Fontana never simply repeated his models: when he reproduced someone else's inventions, he always introduced minor variations or added something personal.
31. For this, see Carlo Cesare Malvasia, *Felsina pittrice*, Bologna, 1678, p. 219; Adalgisa Lugli, "Le *Symbolicae quaestiones* di Achille Bocchi e la cultura dell'emblema in Emilia," in Andrea Emiliani, ed., *Le arti a Bologna e in Emilia dal XVI al XVII secolo*, Bologna, 1982, pp. 87–96; Silla Zamboni, "L'artista e il filosofo: Un episodio inedito del rapporto fra Prospero Fontana e Achille Bocchi," in Elena Sala Di Felice et al., eds., *Intersezioni di forme letterarie e artistiche*, Rome, 2001, pp. 23–32; Ilaria Bianchi, "Disegno e cultura antiquaria nelle *Symbolicae quaestiones* di Achille Bocchi: Il caso del Gaio Mario in fuga da Minturno (simbolo CXI/CXIII) e di un altro inedito di Prospero Fontana (simbolo LVIII)," in Clizia Gurreri and Ilaria Bianchi, eds., *Le virtuose adumanze*, Avellino, 2015, pp. 303–18.
32. The De' Bonardis family was very important for the history of book printing in Bologna; see Albano Sorbelli, *Storia della stampa in Bologna*, Bologna, 1929, pp. 98–99.
33. See Bartsch 1803–21, vol. 12, pp. 16–17. For a recent focus on this artist, see Los Angeles and Washington, DC, 2018, pp. 124–63.
34. Another interesting personality to take into consideration is that of the little-known Alessandro Gandini (fl. c. 1550–80), a Bolognese mathematician and amateur chiaroscuro woodcutter who could easily have been one of the many upper-class friends that Prospero had in town. As pointed out by Jan Johnson ("Alessandro Gandini: Uncovering the Identity of a Chiaroscuro Woodcutter," *Print Quarterly*, 30, no. 1, 2013, pp. 3–13), the source for most of his known prints "may be sought in the Vasari circle," and I think that Gandini's chiaroscuro woodcut of *David and Goliath* (B.XII.026.7 as anonymous; for an impression in the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, inv. no. 1975.522, see <https://collections.mfa.org/objects/174510>), in particular, merges in style with some of Fontana's drawings for Bocchi's *Symbolicarum quaestionum*.
35. On Praun's collection, see Christophe Théophile de Murr, *Description du Cabinet de Monsieur Paul de Praun à Nuremberg*, Nuremberg, 1797; Katrin Achilles-Syndram, *Die Kunstsammlung des Paulus Praun*, Nuremberg, 1994; Piera Giovanna Tordella, "Paulus II von Praun, collezionista di disegni nella Bologna di primo Seicento: Fogli di scuola bolognese e diffusione europea del disegnare in carta azzurra (Olanda e Inghilterra)," in Sabine Frommel, ed., *Crocevia e capitale della migrazione artistica: Forestieri a Bologna e bolognesi nel mondo (secolo XVII)*, Bologna, 2012, pp. 303–12.
36. Inv. no. Gm 1573 (oil on canvas; 95.6 x 74.6 cm); see Gerhard Weber, "Das Praun'sche Kunstkabinett," *Mitteilungen des Vereins für Geschichte der Stadt Nürnberg*, 70, 1983, pp. 125–95, and 138, repr.; Andreas Tacke, *Die Gemälde des 17. Jahrhunderts im Germanischen Nationalmuseum*, Mainz, 1995, no. 36, repr.; and www.bildindex.de/document/obj00150021?medium=mi07752b11. The painting is not included in Maria Teresa Cantaro's catalogue, *Lavinia Fontana bolognese, "pittora singolare" (1552–1614)*, Milan and Rome, 1989.
37. See Malvasia 1678, p. 220.
38. For his work as a set designer, Prospero—like his son-in-law—probably maintained relationships with merchants such as Praun to supply cloth for his theatrical costumes; see Lorena Vallieri, "Prospero Fontana, pittore-scenografo a Bologna (1543)," *Drammaturgia*, 1, 2014, pp. 347–68.
39. See De Murr 1797, pp. 52, 62.
40. Braunschweig, Herzog Anton Ulrich-Museum, inv. no. V 4374 (etching and aquatint with two tones; platemark: 512 x 413 mm; sheet: 581 x 462 mm); see <http://www.virtuelles-kupferstichkabinett.de/en/detail-view>. The Praun collection also held an impression of the corresponding print.
41. Inv. no. 1465. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash; 371 x 285 mm; see www.mfab.hu/artworks/christ-healing-the-sick-2.
42. Perino's original drawing in Budapest for a wall of the Massimo Chapel (see Note 7) also came from the Esterházy collection; see Paul James Le Brooy, *Michelangelo Models, Formerly in the Paul von Praun Collection*, Vancouver, 1972, p. 33.
43. Inv. no. 2211. Pen and brown ink, with brown and gray wash, and opaque white; 341 x 269 mm; see Mantua 2001, p. 181, under no. 73; and <http://arts-graphiques.louvre.fr/detail/oeuvres/1/2964>.
44. Inv. no. 3846. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash; 368 x 285 mm; see Rome 1981–82, vol. 2, p. 130, n. 77.
45. Inv. no. 1980,0126.113. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash, over black chalk; 123 x 93 mm; see Gere and Pouncey 1983, no. 110, repr.; and www.britishmuseum.org/collection/object/P_1980-0126-113.
46. On this topic, see Daniele 2019.