

PROTOCOL – SURVEY EXPERIMENT:

COALITIONS AND INDIVIDUAL SUPPORT FOR POLICY INNOVATION. UNIVERSAL BASIC INCOME IN SPAIN.

Authors:

CÉSAR GUZMÁN-CONCHA, UNIVERSITY OF GENEVA, SWITZERLAND
MARCO GIUGNI, UNIVERSITY OF GENEVA, SWITZERLAND
JULIÁN CÁRDENAS, UNIVERSITY OF VALENCIA, SPAIN

RESEARCH QUESTION AND RATIONALE OF THE STUDY

This study aims at testing the impact of coalitions on the support that citizens give to significant policy reforms. In particular, we examine the effects of different forms of coalitions and non-coalitions (single actor) in the level of support of citizens for a proposal of Universal Basic Income. There are significant streams of research, in political science and sociology, pointing at the relevance of social or political coalitions for welfare reforms and policy change. By coalitions, we understand the assembling of organizations and leaders behind specific demands or issues that they deemed unattended (or threatened) by the government. These organizations and leaders form alliances and initiate campaigns intended to persuade authorities to produce legislation addressing their demands. One of the main goals of coalitions is to gain the public opinion in their favour, as coalitions understand that they will have greater chances of achieving their objectives when citizens support their proposals.

Therefore, the main research question is simple and straightforward: Do coalitions facilitate citizen's endorsement for innovative or radical policy proposals? This question explores whether citizens are more (or less) likely to support a policy innovation or reform when such proposal is presented by a large coalition of social and political actors. In a related vein, this project also seeks to understand whether different forms of coalitions have different effects in the support citizens give to policy proposals. Two main forms of coalitions are examined here:

1. Broad coalitions that include civil society organizations and politicians from different political parties.
2. Coalitions made exclusively of politicians from different parties across the ideological spectrum.

Policy proposals can also be promoted by single actors. Three forms of single actor are examined in this study:

3. Politicians from a mainstream right wing / left wing party.
4. Expert actors, such as academics or scientists.

The policy proposal that we examine in this study is Universal Basic Income. UBI is a controversial policy idea that would involve substantial changes in welfare institutions, which to a great extent challenge the principles in which these are based. Considering its contested nature, and the fact

that there still a considerable opposition to UBI among mainstream political actors in most countries, UBI is a good case to examine whether coalitions can actually persuade more citizens to support this idea.

We suggest that the intensity and/or direction of the dependent variable (support for UBI) can be influenced by two main moderators: ideology, and affiliation to a civil society organization; as well as mediated by social justice orientations (Baron & Kenny, 1986). Ideology can affect the direction of the treatment, as we expect that left-wing ideology would predispose citizens to support the proposal, while right-wing ideology would predispose citizens against it. Similarly, stronger left-wing identification can also predispose to a stronger support of the policy proposal, as in Spain, left-wing parties have been traditionally supporters of the UBI, whereas right-wing parties have been against it. As for the variable “affiliation to civil society organization”, we expect that citizens who are members of these organizations to be more positively predispose to endorse the proposals coming from these actors, thus affecting the intensity of the association between treatment and outcome.

We also suggest that the support for the introduction of a universal basic income is mediated by social justice orientations (Liebig et al., 2016). This means that the treatment will trigger a response depending on the respondent’s ideas of social justice: equality, need, equity and entitlement. Therefore, we expect that persons with basic social justice orientations aligned with notions of equality (“the allocation and distribution of benefits and burdens is just if everyone is allocated the same share”) will be more prone to support UBI. Whereas citizens whose social justice orientations are aligned with entitlement, will be less supportive of UBI. Citizens whose ideas fall closer to principles of need (“benefits are allocated according to people’s individual needs”) and equality (“benefits and burdens [...] are allocated according to individuals’ current individual contributions and efforts”), will exhibit more ambiguous support for UBI. To measure basic social justice orientations, we use a standard question as proposed in Liebig et al (2016).

In the questionnaire, moderators are placed before the treatment, while the mediator is placed after the dependent variable.

MAIN HYPOTHESES.

1. Broad coalitions formed by civil society organizations and members of political parties from across the political spectrum have a positive impact in the support of citizens for a policy innovation (UBI).
2. Coalitions formed only by members of political parties from across the political spectrum have a positive impact in the support of citizens for a policy innovation (UBI), yet lower than a broad coalition formed by civil society organizations and politicians.
3. Proposals of policy innovation formulated exclusively by politicians from a mainstream right-wing/left-wing political party, do not have a substantial positive impact in the level of support for a policy innovation (UBI).
4. Proposals of policy innovations formulated exclusively by scientists/experts, have a positive yet modest impact in the support of citizens for a policy innovation (UBI).

5. Ideology and affiliation to civil society organization influence the intensity of the relationship between treatment and support for UBI.
6. The relationship between independent and dependent variables is mediated by basic social justice orientations, with more support among those whose principles of social justice are aligned with principles of equality, and less support among those whose principles are aligned with principles of entitlement.

DESIGN.

This is a vignette experiment, with subjects randomly assigned to one of five treatment groups or the control condition. In the first group, individuals will be presented a vignette representing a newscast from a news agency, in which a broad coalition of civil society organizations AND politicians from all around the political spectrum urges the government to adopt a universal basic income scheme with no delay. In the second group, individuals will be presented a vignette with a newscast in which a coalition EXCLUSIVELY formed by politicians urges the government to adopt a universal basic income scheme with no delay. In the third group, individuals will be presented with a vignette with a newscast in which politicians from a mainstream left-wing party urge the government to adopt a basic income scheme with no delay. In the fourth group, individuals will be presented with a vignette with a newscast in which politicians from a mainstream right-wing party urge the government to adopt a basic income scheme with no delay. In the fifth group, individuals are presented with a vignette with a newscast in which scientists speaking in a professional/expert capacity urge the government to adopt a basic income scheme with no delay. In the control group, individuals will be presented a vignette with a newscast in which a proposal of universal basic income is presented to the public and the government is urged to take immediate action, but no group or actor is identified in the vignette.

We will use block randomization, where each participant will be randomly assigned to one of the six equally sized, predetermined blocks. The random number list used to create these six blocks will be created using the randomizer provided by Qualtrics^{XM}. The survey is carried out using a sample of 2400 adults (18-64 years old) in SPAIN. Each experimental group includes 400 respondents.

There will be 5 experimental groups, and one control group.

Research design		
		Sample size
Actor(s) advocating for a policy innovation (UBI)	Broad coalition party + civil soc. orgs	400
	Political party coalition	400
	Mainstream left-wing political party	400

	Mainstream right-wing political party	400
	Experts/scientists	400
Control group	No actor identified	400

TREATMENTS

All five experimental groups and the control group will be introduced the same proposal of Universal Basic Income. The characteristics of the UBI proposal are taken from a question posed in the eight wave of the European Social Survey questionnaire 2016 (E36)¹. In this survey experiment we will replicate these characteristics in order to be consistent with the most accepted definition of universal basic income and previous studies.

The treatment (in English language) is as follows:

“A proposal to create a universal basic income has been announced to the public this morning in a press conference in Madrid. The proposers are [THE ACTOR], who was recently created with the aim of demanding the government a legislation on this matter. The press conference is relevant because it shows an initiative from [FURTHER DETAILS ON THE ACTOR].

According to the proponents, a universal basic income would help to tackle pressing social problems, such as poverty and inequalities, which have worsened in recent years due to the Covid-19 pandemic. Furthermore, say the proponents, a universal basic income would help navigate trends such as technological change and the climate crisis, which threaten to destroy thousands of jobs.

¹ This question runs as follows:

“Some countries are currently talking about introducing a basic income scheme. In a moment I will ask you to tell me whether you are against or in favour of this scheme. First, I will give you some more details. The highlighted box at the top of this card shows the main features of the scheme. A basic income scheme includes all of the following:

- The government pays everyone a monthly income to cover essential living costs.
- It replaces many other social benefits.
- The purpose is to guarantee everyone a minimum standard of living.
- Everyone receives the same amount regardless of whether or not they are working.
- People also keep the money they earn from work or other sources.
- This scheme is paid for by taxes.

Overall, would you be against or in favour of having this scheme in [country]?”

For the proponents, a universal basic income that could effectively tackle these problems, should have the following characteristics:

- It is a monthly payment, permanent, in cash, to all working-age adults.
- It is a modest amount aimed at covering some basic needs.
- A universal basic income would replace other social subsidies, but other pillars of the welfare system such as healthcare and unemployment benefits would remain in place.
- All persons would receive the same amount, irrespective of their working status.
- Citizens would dispose of their basic income as they see fit, similarly as they do with other incomes they might receive from formal employment.

To put pressure on the government and parliament, [THE ACTOR] for the universal basic income announces a campaign to collect signatures from citizens to launch a petition, as well as demonstrations in cities all across Spain.”

The treatments (in Spanish) are described in the table below. Highlighted in grey, the sections that vary in each case:

Broad coalition of politicians and civil society organizations	<p>Una propuesta para crear una renta básica universal ha sido presentada esta mañana en una conferencia de prensa en Madrid. Los proponentes son una coalición de entidades sociales y miembros de partidos políticos, formada recientemente con el propósito de solicitar al gobierno una legislación sobre esta materia. La conferencia de prensa es significativa pues escenifica la iniciativa de entidades de la sociedad civil, como los principales sindicatos de ámbito estatal (CCOO y UGT), organizaciones sin fines de lucro (Cáritas, la Cruz Roja y la ONCE), y entidades eclesíásticas y religiosas, y además cuenta con el respaldo de varios diputados del PSOE, el PP y otros grupos parlamentarios.</p> <p>Según los proponentes, un ingreso básico universal, o renta básica, ayudaría a enfrentar graves problemas sociales, como son la pobreza y la desigualdad, los que se han agravado en los últimos años debido a la pandemia de COVID-19. Además, dicen los proponentes, una renta básica ayudaría a afrontar tendencias como el cambio tecnológico y la crisis ambiental, las que amenazan con llevarse por delante miles de empleos.</p> <p>Para los proponentes, una renta básica que pudiera enfrentar los problemas descritos, debería tener las siguientes características:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - se trata de un pago mensual, permanente, y en dinero, a todos los adultos en edad de trabajar. - consiste en un monto modesto pero que permite cubrir ciertas necesidades esenciales. - la renta básica reemplazaría a otros subsidios sociales, pero se mantendrían los otros pilares del estado de bienestar como la sanidad o las prestaciones por desempleo.
--	--

	<p>- todas las personas recibirían el mismo monto, con independencia de si trabajan o no.</p> <p>- las personas dispondrían libremente del dinero de la renta básica, del mismo modo que lo hacen con sus ingresos del trabajo.</p> <p>Para presionar al gobierno y a los partidos en el congreso, la coalición de entidades sociales y partidos políticos por la renta básica anuncia el inicio de una campaña destinada a reunir firmas de ciudadanos, y la celebración de manifestaciones en todas las ciudades de España.</p>
<p>Political parties coalition</p>	<p>Una propuesta para crear una renta básica universal ha sido presentada esta mañana en una conferencia de prensa en Madrid. Los proponentes son un grupo de diputados del PSOE y el PP, y de otros partidos de ámbito autonómico, formada recientemente con el propósito de solicitar al gobierno una legislación sobre esta materia. La conferencia de prensa es significativa pues escenifica la iniciativa de congresistas de los dos partidos más grandes de la izquierda y la derecha.</p> <p>Según los proponentes, un ingreso básico universal, o renta básica, ayudaría a enfrentar graves problemas sociales, como son la pobreza y la desigualdad, los que se han agravado en los últimos años debido a la pandemia de COVID-19. Además, dicen los proponentes, una renta básica ayudaría a afrontar tendencias como el cambio tecnológico y la crisis ambiental, las que amenazan con llevarse por delante miles de empleos.</p> <p>Para los proponentes, una renta básica que pudiera enfrentar los problemas descritos, debería tener las siguientes características:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - se trata de un pago mensual, permanente, y en dinero, a todos los adultos en edad de trabajar. - consiste en un monto modesto pero que permite cubrir ciertas necesidades esenciales. - la renta básica reemplazaría a otros subsidios sociales, pero se mantendrían los otros pilares del estado de bienestar como la sanidad o las prestaciones por desempleo. - todas las personas recibirían el mismo monto, con independencia de si trabajan o no. - las personas dispondrían libremente del dinero de la renta básica, del mismo modo que lo hacen con sus ingresos del trabajo. <p>Para presionar al gobierno y a los partidos en el congreso, los diputados y diputadas del PP y el PSOE por la renta básica anunciaron el inicio de una campaña destinada a reunir firmas de ciudadanos, y la celebración de manifestaciones en todas las ciudades de España.</p>
<p>Single party left coalition</p>	<p>Una propuesta para crear una renta básica universal ha sido presentada esta mañana en una conferencia de prensa en Madrid. Los proponentes son un grupo de diputados del Partido Socialista Obrero Español (PSOE), formado recientemente con el propósito de solicitar al gobierno una legislación sobre esta materia. La conferencia de prensa es</p>

	<p>significativa pues escenifica la iniciativa de congresistas del partido más grande de la izquierda.</p> <p>Según los proponentes, un ingreso básico universal, o renta básica, ayudaría a enfrentar graves problemas sociales, como son la pobreza y la desigualdad, los que se han agravado en los últimos años debido a la pandemia de COVID-19. Además, dicen los proponentes, una renta básica ayudaría a afrontar tendencias como el cambio tecnológico y la crisis ambiental, las que amenazan con llevarse por delante miles de empleos.</p> <p>Para los proponentes, una renta básica que pudiera enfrentar los problemas descritos, debería tener las siguientes características:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - se trata de un pago mensual, permanente, y en dinero, a todos los adultos en edad de trabajar. - consiste en un monto modesto pero que permite cubrir ciertas necesidades esenciales. - la renta básica reemplazaría a otros subsidios sociales, pero se mantendrían los otros pilares del estado de bienestar como la sanidad o las prestaciones por desempleo. - todas las personas recibirían el mismo monto, con independencia de si trabajan o no. - las personas dispondrían libremente del dinero de la renta básica, del mismo modo que lo hacen con sus ingresos del trabajo. <p>Para presionar al gobierno y a los partidos en el congreso, los diputados del PSOE por la renta básica anunciaron el inicio de una campaña destinada a reunir firmas de ciudadanos, y la celebración de manifestaciones en todas las ciudades de España.</p>
Single party right coalition	<p>Una propuesta para crear una renta básica universal ha sido presentada esta mañana en una conferencia de prensa en Madrid. Los proponentes son un grupo de diputados del Partido Popular (PP), formado recientemente con el propósito de solicitar al gobierno una legislación sobre esta materia. La conferencia de prensa es significativa pues escenifica la iniciativa de congresistas del partido más grande de la derecha.</p> <p>Según los proponentes, un ingreso básico universal, o renta básica, ayudaría a enfrentar graves problemas sociales, como son la pobreza y la desigualdad, los que se han agravado en los últimos años debido a la pandemia de COVID-19. Además, dicen los proponentes, una renta básica ayudaría a afrontar tendencias como el cambio tecnológico y la crisis ambiental, las que amenazan con llevarse por delante miles de empleos.</p> <p>Para los proponentes, una renta básica que pudiera enfrentar los problemas descritos, debería tener las siguientes características:</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - se trata de un pago mensual, permanente, y en dinero, a todos los adultos en edad de trabajar. - consiste en un monto modesto pero que permite cubrir ciertas necesidades esenciales. - la renta básica reemplazaría a otros subsidios sociales, pero se mantendrían los otros pilares del estado de bienestar como la sanidad o las prestaciones por desempleo. - todas las personas recibirían el mismo monto, con independencia de si trabajan o no. - las personas dispondrían libremente del dinero de la renta básica, del mismo modo que lo hacen con sus ingresos del trabajo. <p>Para presionar al gobierno y a los partidos en el congreso, los diputados del PP por la renta básica anunciaron el inicio de una campaña destinada a reunir firmas de ciudadanos, y la celebración de manifestaciones en todas las ciudades de España.</p>
Experts/scientists	<p>Una propuesta para crear una renta básica universal ha sido presentada esta mañana en una conferencia de prensa en Madrid. Los proponentes son un grupo de profesores, investigadores y expertos de varias universidades y centros de estudio, formado recientemente con el propósito de solicitar al gobierno una legislación sobre esta materia. La conferencia de prensa es significativa pues escenifica la iniciativa de expertos sin afiliación partidaria.</p> <p>Según los proponentes, un ingreso básico universal, o renta básica, ayudaría a enfrentar graves problemas sociales, como son la pobreza y la desigualdad, los que se han agravado en los últimos años debido a la pandemia de COVID-19. Además, dicen los proponentes, una renta básica ayudaría a afrontar tendencias como el cambio tecnológico y la crisis ambiental, las que amenazan con llevarse por delante miles de empleos.</p> <p>Para los proponentes, una renta básica que pudiera enfrentar los problemas descritos, debería tener las siguientes características:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - se trata de un pago mensual, permanente, y en dinero, a todos los adultos en edad de trabajar. - consiste en un monto modesto pero que permite cubrir ciertas necesidades esenciales. - la renta básica reemplazaría a otros subsidios sociales, pero se mantendrían los otros pilares del estado de bienestar como la sanidad o las prestaciones por desempleo. - todas las personas recibirían el mismo monto, con independencia de si trabajan o no. - las personas dispondrían libremente del dinero de la renta básica, del mismo modo que lo hacen con sus ingresos del trabajo. <p>Para presionar al gobierno y a los partidos en el congreso, los expertos y académicos por la renta básica anunciaron el inicio de una campaña</p>

	destinada a reunir firmas de ciudadanos, y la celebración de manifestaciones en todas las ciudades de España.
Control group	<p>Una propuesta para crear una renta básica universal ha sido presentada esta mañana en una conferencia de prensa en Madrid. Los proponentes pertenecen a un grupo formado recientemente con el propósito de solicitar al gobierno una legislación sobre esta materia. [...]</p> <p>Según los proponentes, un ingreso básico universal, o renta básica, ayudaría a enfrentar graves problemas sociales, como son la pobreza y la desigualdad, los que se han agravado en los últimos años debido a la pandemia de COVID-19. Además, dicen los proponentes, una renta básica ayudaría a afrontar tendencias como el cambio tecnológico y la crisis ambiental, las que amenazan con llevarse por delante miles de empleos.</p> <p>Para los proponentes, una renta básica que pudiera enfrentar los problemas descritos, debería tener las siguientes características:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - se trata de un pago mensual, permanente, y en dinero, a todos los adultos en edad de trabajar. - consiste en un monto modesto pero que permite cubrir ciertas necesidades esenciales. - la renta básica reemplazaría a otros subsidios sociales, pero se mantendrían los otros pilares del estado de bienestar como la sanidad o las prestaciones por desempleo. - todas las personas recibirían el mismo monto, con independencia de si trabajan o no. - las personas dispondrían libremente del dinero de la renta básica, del mismo modo que lo hacen con sus ingresos del trabajo. <p>Para presionar al gobierno y a los partidos en el congreso, los proponentes por la renta básica anunciaron el inicio de una campaña destinada a reunir firmas de ciudadanos, y la celebración de manifestaciones en todas las ciudades de España.</p>

DEPENDENT VARIABLE

The dependent variable is measured in two related manners:

- Support for a Universal Basic Income, in a scale from 1 to 10 where 1 is strongly against and 10 is strongly in favour.

- Would you vote in favour or against a UBI, if you had the option to decide?

5 options: strongly in favour; in favour; abstention; against; strongly against.

ANALYSIS

To test whether the treatment and control groups differ significantly in the dependent variable (support of citizens for the policy innovation), we run one-way ANOVA tests. ANOVA uses F-test to determine whether the variability between groups (comparison of means) is larger than the variability within the groups (standard deviations within each group). Unlike t-test, ANOVA is appropriate when there are more than two independent groups. In our study, six groups are compared (five treatment groups and one control group). If F-statistic is statistically significant ($p\text{-value} \leq 0.05$), we conduct the post hoc Bonferroni multiple pairwise comparison test to identify exactly which group differs from each other. If the normality and equal variance assumption is violated, the non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis test is run instead of ANOVA.

To obtain estimates of the treatment effects and to assess the impact of treatments on the dependent variable, we employ multiple regression (OLS). This multivariate statistical approach permits the inclusion of control variables (gender, age, marital status, nationality, migrant background, religious affiliation) to correct for imbalances between treatments groups due to chance. Moreover, to better understand the relationships between the independent variable (treatment) and the dependent variable (support to the policy innovation), we conduct moderation and mediation analyses. Moderation is a procedure for determining whether a third variable influences the strength or direction of the relationship between an independent and dependent variable. Ideology and affiliation to civil society organizations are considered potential moderators. Leftist citizens, or those affiliated to civil society organizations, can be more likely to support UBI and more predisposed to endorse the proposed policy innovation –especially when this is proposed by a broad coalition, or by a left-wing party. Instead, a mediator variable intermediates between the independent and dependent variables. The purpose of conducting mediation analysis is to check whether the influence of the mediator on the dependent variable is stronger than the influence of the treatment. We consider that social justice orientations can be considered mediators, i.e. they can influence the dependent variable and be influenced by the treatments. In particular, we expect that citizens with equality orientations will be more predisposed to support UBI, while those with entitlement orientations will less predisposed to do so. Citizens with need or equity principles will have a more ambiguous relation with UBI. We run additional regression models to identify moderators (moderating variables) and mediators (mediating variables).

QUESTIONNAIRE AND VARIABLES

Pre-treatment questions:

- Age
- Gender
- Marital status
- Nationality
- Migration background
- Religious affiliation
- Education levels
- Vote in last election

- Ideology (left-right)
- Employment status
- Occupation
- Income
- Political/civic participation

[TREATMENT]

Post-treatment questions:

- **Manipulation check 1:**

In the vignette you have just read, who was the actor who proposed a Universal Basic Income?:

- coalition of civil society organization and politicians
- coalitions of politicians
- politicians of PSOE / PP
- experts, academics
- unclear

- **Manipulation check 2:**

What are the characteristics of the policy described in the vignette?:

- a monthly and periodic cash transfer to all citizens
- social services for all citizens
- in-kind subsidies to poor citizens
- a loan to all adults

[Dependent variables]:

- General assessment of the UBI proposal read in the vignette:
0-10 scale.
- Would you vote in favour or against a UBI, if you had the option to decide?
- Basic Social Justice Orientations

Four statements, each representing the four basic orientations (equality, equity, need, entitlement); degree of agreement with each statement.